With One Voice
Review of Arts and Homelessness in Scotland
May 2018

Co-research Team
William Leadbetter, Jacqui Rogers, Pat McLean & Ann McKenna

Lead Researcher and Report Author
Shelly Coyne
Contents

1. Executive Summary ................................................. Page 3

2. Background to the Review of Arts and Homeless in Scotland ................................. Page 9

3. Homelessness in Scotland ........................................ Page 10

4. Arts and Homelessness Projects in Scotland ........................................ Page 17
   i) Why the arts? ....................................................... Page 17
   ii) Table of organisations and arts practices ................................ Page 20
   iii) Meeting some of the key organisations ................................... Page 21

5. Other Key Stakeholders ............................................. Page 34

6. The Scottish Arts and Homeless Survey ................................ Page 40

7. First Gathering of the Arts and Homelessness Scottish Network ................................. Page 42

8. Findings .......................................................... Page 42

9. Recommendations .................................................. Page 47

10. Conclusion ......................................................... Page 48

11. With Thanks .......................................................... Page 49
1 - Executive Summary

This review of arts and homelessness in Scotland is the fourth country review that With One Voice has commissioned and the first of its kind in the UK. It may have come about serendipitously, but there has been a strong drive to unpick what is happening in Scotland, to uncover why there is such an appetite for innovative arts projects in the sector and to explore both the breadth of the work as well as understand the barriers that prevent more from flourishing.

This report is a snapshot and the result of an eight-month country wide exploration. An internship funded by the Scottish School and Graduate Studies\(^1\) and further financial support from With One Voice, enabled the lead researcher to work with a team of four co-researchers who have experienced homelessness and been involved in the arts. This is With One Voice’s first co-produced review.

We are by no means attempting to create a succinct overview of art and homelessness in Scotland with this review. It is merely an opener, and an invitation to see if there is an appetite for the arts and homeless projects to connect more deeply and grow the sector. We hope it will bring other organisations, particularly those outside of Glasgow and Edinburgh, who may be delivering this work, into a wider community that could perhaps lead to the creation of a national movement.

Like the three reviews before, this review draws on a list of questions that have permeated through all the reports. Unlike the Brazilian and Japanese reviews, this was not prompted to coincide with a Cultural Olympiad and neither was there a proposed budget to support the recommendations, as there had been with the USA/Canada report. With this in mind, the questions were altered accordingly to meet With One Voice’s current capacity to support the growth of the arts and homeless sector in Scotland.

This review looked to explore the following in Scotland:

1. How is homelessness defined and what is the scale?
2. What is the infrastructure of support for people who have been or currently are experiencing homelessness?
3. What known arts work is being delivered?
4. What is the impact and how is it measured?
5. What are the challenges with delivering this work?
6. What are the challenges for the wider arts and homeless sector in Scotland?
7. How might With One Voice meet some of the identified needs and support the sector.

To help answer these questions there were four data gathering opportunities;

1. **Mapping Process** - plotting key organisations involved in delivering arts and homelessness work and those interested in the sector
2. **Data collection** - visiting projects, conducting interviews with stakeholders or those interested in developing the sector in Scotland

\(^1\) Scottish Graduate School of Arts and Humanities. (n.d.) Retrieved from http://www.sgsah.ac.uk/
3. **On-line survey** - capturing further information and experiences from those interested in the sector

4. **Event** - the first gathering of people involved in the arts and homelessness sector in Scotland

44 people were interviewed for the review, 11 arts and homeless projects were visited with many of their arts activities observed in action. 32 people completed the on-line survey and 54 people attended the gathering event in September 2017.

**Homelessness**

In Scotland, unlike the rest of the UK, councils are legally bound to help people find permanent settled accommodation, if they qualify as homeless and meet certain criteria. The statutory homeless figures recorded from people registering as homeless has fallen since 2010 which has been credited to the introduction of Housing Options, a model of homeless prevention implemented by each council. 34,100 homeless applications were made between 2016 and 2017, a 2% drop on the previous year.\(^2\) This only reveals part of the picture and does not account for the ‘hidden homeless’ or people who do not present as homeless to the council. Figures from a Scottish homeless monitor report\(^3\) conducted by Crisis claim that about 50,000 adults, (1.1% of the adult population) experience homelessness each year, with 5,000 adults rough sleeping each year and 660 people sleep rough on a typical night. Research by Crisis also suggests that homelessness is rising in Scotland and set to increase year on year until 2041,\(^4\) with the highest numbers across the next 20 years being sofa-surfers. All those interviewed for this review testified to the increasing visibility of people on the streets of Glasgow and Edinburgh both begging and rough sleeping, which appeared to be growing.

Scotland has a population of approximately 5.5 million which is disproportionally dispersed over its 30,000 square miles. The central belt is where the main cities and towns lie, including Edinburgh and Glasgow with Greater Glasgow housing nearly a quarter of all of Scotland’s population. The Scottish National Party (SNP), the largest political party in Scotland, is currently in government at Scotland’s devolved parliament, standing on a platform promoting equality, social justice and social

---


welfare. This perhaps reflects something about a pervading national culture and may give some indication why Scotland has already lead the way with two international innovative homeless organisations. It is home to The Homeless World Cup and the International Network of Street Papers, both registered as Scottish charities. Scotland may be said to bring a pioneering response to homelessness and this may explain why such a small country has such a wealth of arts and homeless activities relative to its size. This climate may also be ideal for exploring and implementing a national integrated arts and homeless programme.

In addition, at the time of writing this report, a Scottish Cultural Strategy is being developed, led by Leonie Bell, Head of Cultural Engagement and Culture Strategy at the Scottish Government. In an engagement report published by Scottish Government, it was noted that ‘there was unequal engagement in culture with the view that those from lower socio-economic groups…were less likely to engage’, however, ‘culture could have a positive impact (or make a contribution to) outcomes in a wide range of areas including communities; health and well-being; inclusive economic growth; education; international relations; improved mental health; and society overall. It was also mentioned that culture could have a positive impact on housing and local regeneration; poverty and justice…’

Arts and Homelessness

This review has identified 23 organisations and projects that have or are currently delivering arts work with people experiencing homelessness in Scotland:

**Glasgow** – there are 13 organisations; two are homeless day centres, one is a hostel, nine are arts organisations and charities and one is a housing association.

**Edinburgh** – there are nine organisations; four are services set up to support homeless or vulnerable people and five are arts organisations and charities.

**Aberdeen** – only one project using arts with people who have experienced homelessness was identified outside of Glasgow and Edinburgh and this is Aberdeen Foyer, a social enterprise working with homeless young people.

There are 16 organisations currently delivering work that this review has identified.


Findings

- Scotland has a rich and diverse arts and homeless sector with a wealth of innovative projects that are clustered predominantly in Glasgow and Edinburgh.
- Those interviewed about delivering and participating in activities without exception were passionate about the work and positive about the impact.
- 95% of the people interviewed and 84.4% of those completing the on-line survey said ‘Yes', Scotland needs more arts activities for people experiencing homelessness.
- The research team are aware of 23 projects delivering work in Scotland and 16 of these are currently running. 6 of the 16 are delivered by faith-based organisations.
- The sector is disjointed and disparate, however and there is a strong feeling that people want to be connected and feel part of a network.
- There is a sense from those trying to deliver the activities that the work is undervalued.
  a) This was experienced within homeless organisations where other services are viewed as more important.
  b) It was felt when funders were unable to financially support the continuation or start-up of new projects.
  c) Those running groups felt participants sometimes did not place value on the activity.
- Funding is the biggest barrier to more arts activities being delivered.
- Having well-trained staff is the next barrier to more arts activities being delivered.
- The most successful arts and homeless activities are run by appropriately trained staff who form positive relationships with participants and create a safe supportive environment.
- Sessions benefited from being well promoted and supported and signposted by staff outside of the groups.
- Time was needed to allow an activity to embed and grow.
- There is no coherency around what information is gathered by each organisation to measure the impact of the work. A policy maker suggested the sector needs more collective evidence to show the impact of the work in Scotland.
- A three-year Housing First pilot was conducted in Glasgow and the evaluation report concluded that ‘involvement with meaningful activities in the community has gone some way to mitigating the loneliness experienced by a few service users’ and ‘there remains a need to develop innovative ways to combat social isolation’. This might be a gap that the arts and homeless sector may be able to address.

Recommendations

1. Link those who are interested across the sector to form a network
   • It has been suggested that creating a self-supporting community like the Scottish Prison Arts Network would benefit the sector.
   • An open network could enable the sharing of resources, best practise, funding streams and training and mentoring opportunities. The network could also be a hub to share practice and policy beyond Scotland, with the international arts and homelessness sector.
   • A network would help raise awareness of current activities and help with promotion and signposting.
   • A network could help make links between organisations offering or seeking resources.

2. Increase awareness of other organisations delivering arts activities or wishing to deliver activities in Scotland
   • To explore other activities that are happening across Scotland particularly out-with Glasgow and Edinburgh.
   • To discover other organisations that wish to deliver this work but have so far been unable.

3. Look at creating and implementing a training model to bolster the sector with appropriately trained arts practitioners

4. Support the sector to gather evidence to improve the delivery and validate the impact of the work
   • Sharing of impact measures across the sector.
   • Collecting a bank of evaluation reports, academic research and case studies, using With One Voice’s Literature Review as a starting point.
   • Conducting academic research across Scotland.

5. Help organisations explore how they might secure long-term embedded or partnership funding
   • Run a funding awareness day with funders and successful projects who have secured long term funding.
   • Work with policy makers, funders and academics to consider long term embedded funding.
   • Share best practise from other successful projects such as Streetwise Opera.

6. For the sector to unite and work towards a national arts event, showcasing and celebrating work in Scotland
Conclusions

While the recommendations suggest some steps that Scotland might take to grow and develop the arts and homeless sector in Scotland it is perhaps useful to consider a strategic focus for the sector.

This could take the form of initially sustaining the current work being delivered, followed by growing and developing the sector, while exploring how the arts may become embedded in Scottish policy around homeless services.

1. Sustain the current field by supporting organisations currently or recently delivering arts activities.
2. Find other organisations and projects delivering arts activities that have not featured in the report and invite them into a network.
3. Find organisations and projects that want to develop arts activities and support them to help grow the sector.
4. Look at ways to measure the impact of the work in Scotland.
5. Encourage policy makers to draw on the current evidence to explore embedding arts practice within the homeless services nationwide.
2 - Background to the Arts and Homeless Review of Scotland

The vision for this review of Scotland began in Rio in 2017 at the launch of the With One Voice international arts and homelessness movement. Matt Peacock, the Director of With One Voice and Shelly Coyne, a choir leader and PhD student from Scotland, were discussing the rich and varied projects in Scotland and enthusiasm for this work. They imagined what Scotland might look like if it became the first country to have a fully integrated arts and homeless sector embedded in national government policy. A seed was sown and a plan to conduct an arts and homeless review to understand the current sector in Scotland was born.

Shelly had worked as a choir leader at the Lodging House Mission since 2010 and was researching choirs and community singing groups set up for people who have experienced homelessness for a PhD. An internship funded by The Scottish Graduate School of Arts and Humanities created the capacity for her to lead this review, mapping current projects, understanding the challenges and barriers and looking at how With One Voice might support a movement in Scotland. With One Voice provided additional funding to meet associated costs of the review. Creative Scotland and the Institute for Music in Human and Social Development at Edinburgh University were both interested in the enquiry and supported the review and the first gathering of people involved in the arts and homelessness sector in Scotland in September 2017.

With One Voice

With One Voice, a project developed by the charity Streetwise Opera, is an international arts and homelessness movement which works globally to support and connect the arts the homelessness sector. It works alongside existing projects and helps support new activities, by understanding the barriers and challenges and raising awareness of the sector. It has organised international exchanges in practice and policy helping to grow the field. This review stands on the shoulders of three others, conducted in Brazil, USA and Canada and one in Japan. Scotland already has rich and varied arts projects for people who have experienced homelessness, but like Beth Knowles the author of the USA and Canada report stated ‘It is a sector that is often fragmented, under resourced and seen to be peripheral to the main support structures put in place for people experiencing homelessness’.

This is the first review in the UK and the first to include a team of co-researchers; people who have experienced homelessness and been involved in the arts. William Leadbetter, Jacqui Rogers, Pat McLean and Ann McKenna joined Shelly to make up the research team. They were involved in co-designing the questions and conducting the interviews. Their

Research team: Ann, Pat, Shelly, William and Jacqui
feedback from each project visit and interview contributed to content of this report. The team helped shape and lead on the first arts and homeless gathering event.

As the Scottish arts and homelessness sector develops, it is worth noting the wider global arts and homelessness context and With One Voice’s work in encouraging practice and policy exchange. The sector in Scotland is now connected to this global movement and community and it is hoped that exchange of ideas and methodologies will take place. The work of With One Voice is explored further in Section 5.

3 - Homelessness in Scotland

Before looking at the situation of homelessness in Scotland and how it relates to the arts, some background and context is necessary. To attempt to present an evolving situation in a short summary or to generalise about a highly complex issue is somewhat challenging and a little meaningless. There also needs to be a note of caution that ‘The Homeless’ are not thought of as one homogenous community of people with the same needs. The definition of homeless certainly means many different things to many different types of people and is often a culmination of multiple issues.

This chapter merely attempts to offer an informed snap shot from a broad spectrum of sources of some aspects of homelessness from some geographical areas of Scotland in 2017.

We gathered our information from:
1. Scottish Government statistics
2. Research conducted by the national charities and organisations such as Shelter and Crisis
3. People with lived experience of homelessness from Glasgow and Edinburgh
4. People without lived experience of homelessness who were interviewed for this report

About 50,000 adults, 1.1% of the Scottish adult population experience homelessness each year
Rough sleeping is experienced by around 5,000 adults in Scotland each year
660 sleep rough on a typical night


---

In Scotland, unlike the rest of the UK, councils are legally bound to help people find permanent settled accommodation if they qualify as homeless and meet the following criteria:
1. Be legally homeless now or in 28 days. Have no accommodation or unable to access their home. Live in a violent household, an overcrowded household, an unclean or unsafe home. Live with family or friends but have been asked to leave. Live in a B and B, hostel or refuge.
2. Be born in the UK or European Economic Area
3. Not become homeless intentionally
4. Have a connection with the local council

A decision is supposed to be made in 28 days, however, accommodation is unlikely to be found immediately.

Urban Café at Glasgow City Mission

In 2015-16, 34,662 homeless applications were made in Scotland. This number has been going down and is attributed to the preventative approach of Housing Options, which is run by all Scottish councils and offers general help with housing advice and includes an early homeless intervention. Applications in 2016 – 2017 were 34,100.

Services around employability, mental health, money advice and family mediation are offered to help with issues from an early stage in the hope of avoiding a housing crisis. This preventative approach has been credited with bringing the number of homeless applications down, although it is believed the main issues driving homelessness have not changed.

---


Research conducted by Crisis anticipate that core homelessness in Scotland is set to steadily rise year on year, over the next twenty-four years.\textsuperscript{11}

Those experiencing homeless in Scotland are loosely categorised in the following ways,

1. People who are rough or street sleeping.
2. People in temporary accommodation. This includes; night shelters, hostels, B and B’s, women’s refuges and can include private and social housing.
3. The hidden homeless. This growing category that by its very nature is very hard to quantify, but includes people staying with family and friends, sofa surfing, and living in unsuitable housing, squats or ‘bed in shed’ situations.

\begin{quote}
People experiencing street homelessness are:
\begin{itemize}
  \item 9 times more likely to take their own life than the general public
  \item 17 times more likely to have been a victim of violence
47 is the average age of death for someone who is homeless
\end{itemize}
\end{quote}

Teixeira, L. (2017) Ending Homelessness Faster by Focusing on ‘What Works’\textsuperscript{12}

There are a range of services that offer support for those experiencing homeless:

1. Local Council Services
   a) The point of contact for homeless applications, community casework teams and individual case workers.
   b) Shelters - emergency accommodation.
   c) Hostels.
   d) Supported Housing.
2. National charities and organisations such as Shelter, Crisis, The Salvation Army.
3. Day Centres and night centres, including the Lodging House Mission, City Mission, Niddry Street Drop-in Centre, Marie Trust.
4. Support offered on the street – including Street Work, Simon Community street outreach, the Care Van.
5. Additional targeted support; including dentist, doctor, optician, mental health services, housing advice, legal advice, money advice, domestic violence support, rape crisis, food banks.


6. Local charities, churches and organisations offering a range of support and opportunities, including a winter shelter, access to the arts, support for refugees, support for young people.

**In September 2017**

- 10,899 households were in temporary accommodation and 27% living in bed and breakfasts, hostels and hotels
- 6,581 dependent children were living in temporary accommodation


**Personal perceptions and reflections on homelessness in Scotland**

The forty-four people interviewed for this report were asked to give an impression of how they viewed the homeless situation in Scotland. All interviewees were from Glasgow and Edinburgh, giving their personal perceptions of the two largest cities with the largest numbers of those experiencing homelessness in Scotland.

There was some discussion about whether homelessness had changed in recent years; many said the numbers of homeless people on the streets appears to have gone up and that the situation appears to have got worse and is our ‘biggest problem in society’. Those working in homeless centres gave mixed views; some agreed the

---

number seemed to have increased, some felt the situation was neither better or worse, others said it looked worse but was just more complex.

There were many insightful personal views around homelessness in Scotland highlighted through the interviews:

- Not enough beds in hostels, not enough emergency accommodation and not enough council flats.
- There are bottle-necks that build up throughout the system preventing people moving on to the next level of independence or support.
- There are more international residents in hostels, including asylum seekers and refugees.
- The Commonwealth Games in Glasgow in 2014 lead to safe sleeping places being boarded up and street sleepers being put in hotels during the games. With less hidden spaces to sleep, there is now an increase in the numbers of people visible on the streets at night.
- The current small-bed hostel model is a huge improvement on the larger impersonal ones that were closed in the 1990’s bringing an end to protection rackets. Some hostels are still seen as dangerous and intimidating places were the vulnerable are preyed on by other residents.
- There are different rules in each hostel which leads to residents losing their place if they do not stick to the rules. For example, in one hostel, you might instantly lose your place if you do not sleep in your bed for one night.
- Many believe the introduction of Universal Credit will make the homeless situation worse in Scotland.
- Case Workers who are key to people accessing permanent accommodation have more cases than they can handle. Stories abound of waiting for two months to get an appointment.
- The transition gaps between hostels and more permanent accommodation seem to be a key period when things could go wrong and people who are on a projection of leaving the streets fall through the gaps and go back into street sleeping.
- The situation of experiencing homelessness and trying to get safe permanent accommodation was described by one case worker as ‘chaos’ and she repeated the word ‘misery’, when describing the lives of those she supports every day.
- Issues were repeatedly raised about people moving off the streets into a home but feeling isolated. Keeping a tenancy for some is linked to being socially connected.
- Mental health issues seem to be more prevalent and growing.
- People want their own place but need support to maintain that tenancy. Support may be with budgeting, keeping socially active or having the personal tools to keep their new home a safe space and controlling who enters the property.
- There was frustration by some staff in the sector that people experiencing homelessness do not always engage with services on offer.
- Legal highs were described as ‘the killer’ and having a detrimental effect for those on the streets.
15

- Addictions to drugs and alcohol generally are keeping people on the streets and preventing them moving into hostels.
- Some interviewees had more positive messages; free or cheap food is always available at least in the cities, the support for women seemed to have improved, situation is more favourable in the UK than in other parts of the world and there is often a strong sense of empathy and responsibility by the public for people experiencing homelessness.

Even though we have a sense of the number of homeless applications and those in temporary accommodation there is no coherent sense of the numbers of homeless across Scotland. There is no known street count system or clarity around exactly how many hidden homeless there are or how many people will not or cannot access local authority help. It has been reported however that half of those receiving help from charities in Glasgow have not approached their local authority.

![The life-sized statue of a homeless person in Nelson Mandela Square in Glasgow](image)

On closer inspection, this statue, by Timothy Schmalz, depicts Jesus and is one of many similar statues across the world, raising international awareness of homelessness.

Scotland is implementing some innovative approaches to tackling its homeless crisis;

- City Ambition Network is an innovative partnership of Glasgow organisations and agencies working intensively to break the cycle of rough sleeping for the most vulnerable who have previously struggled to accept help.¹⁴
- Housing First approach is an international recognised intervention that has been shown to end homelessness for eight out of ten people with high support needs. Housing First looks to provide people with a secure home as a priority

and then flexible support is built for individuals to help maintain the tenancy. A three-year Housing First pilot was conducted in Glasgow and the evaluation report\textsuperscript{15} concluded that ‘involvement with meaningful activities in the community has gone some way to mitigating the loneliness experienced by a few service users’ and ‘there remains a need to develop innovative ways to combat social isolation’. This might be a gap that the arts and homeless sector may be able to address.

- A new Centre for Homeless Impact has just opened in Glasgow\textsuperscript{16} and in keeping with this review, the centre is committed to using co-production. The centre works with people who have experienced homelessness to help design, evaluate, disseminate and train professionals in the homeless sector. Their feasibility study conducted in January 2017 stated that ‘for far too long people affected by homelessness have been left out of much of the debates surrounding evidence for policy and practice\textsuperscript{17}.

- The Scottish government has introduced a Homeless and Rough Sleeping Action Group which seeks to eradicate rough sleeping and the use of temporary accommodation.\textsuperscript{18}


4 - Arts and Homelessness Projects in Scotland

Scotland seems to bring an innovative and creative approach to tackling its social issues. So, perhaps it is no surprise that there is a healthy range of arts projects that have been running for many years with people who have experienced homelessness and a strong appetite for developing more.

This chapter looks at the impact of arts participation then explores organisations currently delivering work as well as historical activities.

Why the Arts?

The impact of being involved in the arts for people who have experienced homelessness is a broad and complex issue. There are some evaluation reports from organisations, transformational testimonials from participants and research being conducted by arts organisations such as With One Voice. There has been some international academic research too and a doctoral research study is currently being conducted at the University of Edinburgh by this report’s author, Shelly Coyne. It is not however a magic pill. It is not a one-size fits all. It will not lead to a positive outcome for everyone. But those working on the ground, those who attend the sessions and the growing body of research indicates that participating can be transformational for many.

The benefits cited by those involved in this review can be loosely grouped into four main themes;

1. Participation changes how participants feel about themselves
   - Participants say they feel good about themselves a happier
• Life’s more colourful not so grey and black
• People feel looked after
• There is a shift in confidence, self-esteem, leading to growth and development
• People can reconnect back with themselves
• It brings moments of peace and reprieve
• And a chance to become someone else, particularly through opera and theatre
• It gives people a voice

2. It brings connection and sense of belonging
• People see each other as real people
• Feeling included not isolated
• Sense of belonging
• Staff said it can help strengthen relationships between them and participants and lead to a more positive working environment

3. It can lead to a more positive future
• More doors seem to be opened
• There’s more possibilities
• Helps break chronic mental health cycles
• Chance to reconnect with society
• Can lead to volunteering and work opportunities
• Can help with maintaining a tenancy

4. The arts can lead to an attitudinal shift
   i) For participants
   • To focus on what they can contribute and a chance to put something back
   • An opportunity to see themselves in a positive light - not just a client or a resident but a person, a human with individual needs and aspirations
   • To feel valued
   • More willing to accept support services
      i) For staff working with participants there are closer relationships, less hierarchy, more harmony
      ii) Audiences / society
   • The arts can lift the lid and inform about unheard subjects
   • The public see a person experiencing homelessness as a complete person, their talents and not their problems
People experiencing homelessness that have been involved in the arts said:

‘If it wasn’t for this I wouldn’t still be here’

‘It’s being part of something, I’ve never been part of something in my life’

‘I see myself different’

‘I was under a rock for a long time. I basically found the choir and started seeing some light. The choir reached its branches out to me, it embraced me; it was like a huge family’.

Jacqui Rodgers, co-researcher

Those working in the sector when asked about arts for people experiencing homelessness said:

‘When the media start talking about scroungers we’re able to talk about people who have got something to give society’

Grant Campbell. Chief Executive Glasgow City Mission

‘See people for what they are, not their problems’

Jane Davidson. Scottish Opera

‘It brings moments of reprieve, something to feel good about’

Elly Goodman. Citizens Theatre
The review has identified 16 organisations that are currently delivering this work, with a further seven who have previously been involved.

**Glasgow**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project</th>
<th>Arts Practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Theatre and the Chara Centre</td>
<td>Drama, singing, song writing, creative writing, guitar playing, magazine production, theatre visits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lodging House Mission</td>
<td>Choir, drama, art, photography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glasgow City Mission</td>
<td>Art classes, art exhibition, music group, music studio, photography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Marie Trust</td>
<td>Expressive arts classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Moments Peace Theatre Company</td>
<td>Theatre and drama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the Pavement</td>
<td>Journalism, photography, training opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Open Museum</td>
<td>The Open Museum is Glasgow’s Museum Outreach Service which in 2017 focussed on homelessness in Glasgow. They worked with an artist and people from the night shelter for destitute asylum seekers. Work was exhibited in a shopping centre. Previous exhibitions have recounted experiences from the Homeless World Cup.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foolproof Creative Arts</td>
<td>Drama, music and arts and crafts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theatre Nemo</td>
<td>Theatre, Drama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Givin’ it Laldie</td>
<td>Initially helped set up the choir at Lodging House Mission. People with lived experience of homelessness are welcomed to their choirs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Salvation Army</td>
<td>Service users joined across the west of Scotland to form a choir for a Christmas concert in Glasgow in 2017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottish Opera</td>
<td>Ran a 3-year partnership with Lodging House Mission. Writing and performing two original operas with the choir.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phoenix Futures</td>
<td>Charity helping people overcome drug and alcohol issues. They run an extensive Recovery Through Arts Programme.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Edinburgh**

| Grassmarket Community Project                   | Music group, choir, art classes, photography, drama, sewing, woodwork, cookery |
| Inspire                                         | Guitar groups, music making session, choir, song writing                       |
| Crisis Skylight                                 | Art groups, music group, choir, photography                                    |
| Bethany Christian Trust                         | Choir, guitar group, magazine production                                       |
| The Salvation Army; The Pleasance Life House and Niddry Street Drop-in centre | Creative writing, art, music group                                            |
| Streetreads                                     | Book lending service                                                          |
| Raised Voices                                   | Creative writing, play writing, performance, drama, reviewing performances     |
| The Rock Trust                                  | Street graffiti, music making                                                  |
| Tinderbox                                       | Music making, song writing                                                    |

**Aberdeen**

| Foyer Aberdeen                                  | Arts and crafts, music studio                                                 |
Some of these organisations met the research team to explain more about their work

Glasgow

Citizens Theatre and The Chara Centre

‘The Citz’ is viewed by many as something of a trail blazer for its high quality professional arts and homelessness work in Scotland which they have been developing and growing over many years. They deliver 2 groups with at-risk women living in emergency respite at The Chara Centre;

- **Women's Own**: a creative art group that uses drama, music, singing, visual art, textile work and costume modelling in their weekly workshops. The group work towards 2 productions each year.

  ![](image)
  *Women’s Own group in action*

- **The C Word**: a magazine developing residents’ journalism, IT, editorial, design, and creative writing skills by creating and publishing Scotland’s first magazine by and for women experiencing homelessness.

The partnership with Chara is an exemplar model of an arts organisation and a hostel working in a successful partnership. This is partly due to the Chara support staff fully participating in all aspects of the magazine production and performances. They are positive gate keepers promoting the session throughout the hostel. The success is also due to the staff from the Citizens who bring a wealth of experience, drawing on many arts forms. The groups run on a three-year funding cycle, enabling progression and forward planning.
The Citizen also run a theatre visits programme which enables women from The Chara Centre to attend high quality productions at the Citizens Theatre. This opportunity is available to all groups connected to the theatre who experience homelessness. One resident from Chara said about the theatre visits, ‘I have as much right to be here as anyone else’.

They also run a community-based theatre group called the Community Collective and the open-door policy creates opportunities for former residents from Chara, and those at risk of homelessness or those experiencing homelessness to be involved in community arts and perform in public and main stage Citizens Theatre productions.

When members were asked about these two Chara groups they said,

‘This is what kept us going’
‘Found out I’m good at doing this’
‘It’s the best buzz I ever had’
‘Keeps us grounded’

The Community Collective rehearsing The Gorbals Vampire

The Citizens have been involved in running creative programmes in partnership with support services across Glasgow such as the 218 Women’s service and Tomorrows Women. This has enabled both organisations to embed the arts as part of their services and annual programming.

The model the Citizens have created is highly successful in supporting those experiencing homelessness at many different stages through and beyond homelessness, enabling people to build their own community and networks. This inevitably helps address issues of social isolation, which has been reported as a cause for people unable to maintain their tenancy. Importantly two practitioners
Elly Goodman and Carly McCaig are involved in all the sessions mentioned, ensuring continuity and maintaining a trusting relationship with participants.

Glasgow City Mission

Glasgow City Mission, maybe the world’s oldest city mission but there is nothing old fashioned or historic about this charity or their current premises. Their beautiful light airy purpose-built building boasts a city centre location, recording studio, gym and a roof garden. Its strong Christian ethos guides their services which focus on offering an immediate response to the needs of marginalised and homeless in Glasgow and preventative work with children and families across the city.

‘People turn up bruised, they believe they’ve nothing to give’.
Grant Campbell, the Chief Executive of Glasgow City Mission

‘We just really help people be the best they can be’

‘People say to us, ‘I do want to try this, but I don’t want to try it at a different service I want to try to here, because I know the building, I know the staff, I feel safe here’

Susan Tulley, Urban Project Worker

The city centre hub offers an evolving three-month timetable of day time activities which have a strong focus on the arts. There are a range of musical activities that are available including use of instruments, guitar lessons, access to a recording studio, DJ workshops and joining a choir. Art plays a leading part in the social programme with art, photography and pottery sessions delivered. There is an interesting partnership with the Glasgow School of Art, with students volunteering and encouraging people using the centre to join them for a chat and a draw! Artists from the centre have an opportunity to exhibit and sell their work in a public exhibition at the mission when the building is turned into an art gallery. The art space is supported by a Presenting Issues member of staff who is on hand to address any immediate issues and offer 1 to 1 support during the arts sessions.

Glasgow City Mission places a strong emphasis on really meeting people where they are at, whatever their situation when they arrive at the centre. They seem truly responsive to what people say they need and they create an arts and education programme in response to that on-going conversation. They also have a strong staff team that support and enable people to access their arts sessions.

Glasgow’s City Mission city centre building
The Lodging House Mission

The Lodging House Mission is a key safety net in the city, based in the east end of Glasgow, it offers day time support to some of the most disadvantaged in Glasgow. This charity offers two levels of support. The first aims to meet the immediate needs of those that come through the door, offering food and a safe warm place in the day as well as a night shelter for four months of the year. The second offers holistic support through a programme of activities, education and chaplaincy. The centre has recently started opening at the weekend and one evening.

The Lodging House Mission Choir rehearsing The Blue Tango Club
(Photo Credit – Robin Mitchell)

The Lodging House Mission has had a long commitment to the arts and has over the years had a guitar group, a choir, drama group, arts classes and a sewing and crafts group. It has also continued to host concerts and music performances. Mission Voices, formally known as the Lodging House Mission choir, has run for seven years and was involved in a three-year partnership with Scottish Opera with singers involved in writing and performing two original operas.

This partnership coincided with the first With One Voice event at the Royal Opera House for the cultural Olympiad, where 300 performers with experience of homelessness, came together to perform. The choir travelled to London and sang an excerpt from one of the operas, Who Killed John King. Currently the centre runs their choir Mission Voices, a weekly drama group and a women’s group which creates gifts to sell using knitting and sewing.

The Pavement

*the Pavement* is a tiny UK-wide homeless charity with big ideas. Since 2005, they have published a free magazine for a homeless readership, produced alongside a website, which includes a unique listings service covering the essentials of what people experiencing homelessness might need to know: soup kitchens, day centres, night shelters, mental health support, addiction services. It also signposts arts opportunities
for its readers in Scotland. It is distributed in London, Edinburgh and Glasgow. Copy is provided by volunteer journalists who are commissioned to write news stories, features and columns. Some of these volunteers have experience of homelessness. The organisation also runs trainee journalism programmes to support those who wish to develop their journalistic skills. In Glasgow the peer journalism project is based in the Lodging House Mission with a core group of about six regular members, with others contributing their stories and experiences. In London, *the Pavement* holds monthly meetings for their volunteer reporters as well as contributing to an ongoing journalism project with homeless health charity Groundswell called, From the Ground Up.

These volunteer journalists cover the news from the streets or news affecting the streets, dealing with topics ignored by the mainstream press. They produce a unique blend of reportage, advice, cartoons and inspiring real-life stories, written with *the Pavement*’s homeless readership firmly in mind. The volunteers are involved in every aspect of producing and circulating the magazine including distribution.

**Homeless people need the Pavement. It gives us a voice and we don’t have a voice. You don’t hear these stories in the mainstream media.**

Reader of the Pavement who has experienced homelessness

During 2017-18 the Glasgow group wrote about projects that people who are experiencing homelessness in Glasgow can access. These included local bike projects, singing groups and choirs, writing and film opportunities, cooking, walking and gardening activities. The group met with each project and its participants, conducting interviews and sound recordings and taking photographs before co-writing a piece and selecting photographs for the magazine.

**Foolproof Creative Arts**

With its commitment to promoting creativity and encouraging community, this Christian arts organisation works across the community using drama, music and arts and crafts. It currently runs a drama group in the Lodging House Mission. Their philosophy is to use drama and performance to elevate individual’s personal stories, ensuring they are heard and given value. Sadly, Foolproof Creative Arts have been unsuccessful in securing funding to deliver more drama and performance-based work in Glasgow and Edinburgh, but seek to grow their work with actors experiencing homelessness.

**Scottish Opera**

Jane Davidson, Director of Outreach and Education at Scottish Opera, brings valuable experience of leading projects with people who have experienced homelessness and
strongly advocates that this work be delivered within an environment of world class excellence and professionalism. The partnership with the Lodging House Mission saw a team from Scottish Opera co-write two operas with the singers from the choir; Who Killed John King and The Blue Tango Club. These were performed across the city including at the Citizens Theatre and Scottish Youth Theatre and an excerpt of Who Killed John King was performed at the Royal Opera House in London.

![Mission Voices Choir singing at The Royal Opera House in 2012](Photo Credit: Curtis Gibson, for Streetwise Opera)

Jane believes the jumping-off point is the same for all the musicians they work with in the community; whether that is with children, people living with dementia or those with experience of homelessness. It is all about giving a high-quality experience with a focus on relationship building. Jane is passionate about the need to have the right staff leading this work and believes it is key to growing this sector in Scotland. Jane and Shelly Coyne have explored a training model whereby Scottish Opera could be involved in helping to train staff in this sector, working in conjunction with experienced arts practitioners already in the homeless field. Co-trainers who have experienced arts and homelessness could also be involved in delivering the training. From this work, a template could be created that might be useful for training purposes across the UK.
Edinburgh

The Grassmarket Community Project (GCP)

The GCP is one of a handful of exemplar organisations in Edinburgh working with vulnerable adults and offering a programme of opportunities including quality arts activities. They have a long history of supporting people experiencing homelessness, although their doors are now open to anyone who is socially isolated and vulnerable. Those who wish to get involved in the project become members and can access a range of activities.

- GCP runs an extensive timetable of weekly activities and workshops. These currently include art, drama, creative writing, choir, a make and mend group, a tartan group, woodwork, photography, and gardening.
- Their renowned woodwork and tartan social enterprises are core to their work and are sustained through the support of members.
- The centre runs a weekly community cinema which is free to attend.

The work of the organisation is to reduce social isolation, by running a range of activities that ‘hooks people in’ and gets them engaged.

The Grassmarket Community Project's choir in action

The organisation has a three-tier approach:

i) The first is to get people turning up and getting involved in a place where they feel safe. By participating in activities, they increase their self-esteem and self-worth and re-connect with themselves.

ii) Through being with others in the group activities, people develop social skills, feel looked after and part of a family

iii) Finally, then re-connect more widely with society.

‘This stuff works’

Jonny Kinross,
CEO Grassmarket Community Project
Members can become volunteers and contribute to the running of the project and there is a strong focus encouraging people to use their skills to help run GCP, including co-delivering of projects. Jonny Kinross the CEO says ‘nothing makes a person feel better than feeling useful. We really value what the volunteers bring and we really value what volunteering brings for the most vulnerable in society, because if you’ve got low self-esteem nothing speaks louder than saying we really value you, what you can bring to our lives’.

Jonny believes the arts should be offered as a core service and have the same value as support for drug and alcohol addiction, housing, counselling etc. He believes that at one stage in a person’s life it might be support around drugs that a person needs, at another time it might be something that comes from the arts.

Inspire

Inspire is nothing short of a truly inspiring community music organisation. Based in Edinburgh at the Scots Music Group, they seek to broaden access to community music by working in partnership with other local support organisations. It creates opportunities for the vulnerable and excluded to take part in music, who might not otherwise be given the opportunity. They have worked across the city with people who have experienced homelessness, working in hostels (Cunningham House) day centres (The Bethany Christian Trust) and charities (The Rock Trust). They work with other projects that support people with mental health issues and have delivered a group at The Hive at Edinburgh Royal Hospital. Inspire run formal music groups, individual lessons, and drop-in sessions. They also have a community choir for those who have taken part in their partner project music groups or been referred from other support organisations.

Due to inconsistent funding, Inspire has run as three distinct projects since 2010 (Inspire 1, 2 & 3) with each one working towards a final output. Inspire 3 created a songbook with compositions from participants across the project. Yet despite the funding challenges, one of the great stand-out qualities of this project and an area praised during its external evaluation is the quality of staff the organisation has attracted. This team of highly skilled music-making practitioners, experienced in working with vulnerable participants, have demonstrated great commitment and passion for the project. The legacy model at Inspire is that staff help develop the music leading skills of the staff at the partner organisations, through mentoring and music forums.

Scots Music Group have sadly been unable to fund Inspire 4 much to the sadness and shock of those involved and the wider community. They are, however, still working to revive the project.
One of the partner organisations said of Inspire,

“Most of our people have pretty chaotic lifestyles. They are not in employment and they rarely have any reason to know which day of the week it is, so simply saying that there is a group on a Wednesday isn’t quite enough to get them attending regularly.

In fact, it’s more likely that they would recognise a day as ‘music day’ than actually know it was a Wednesday or whatever. Having someone here every week, week in, week out, has meant that we’ve been able to get more people coming here than if we’d just run a short-term thing.”

Crisis Skylight Edinburgh

Crisis is a national charity that supports people out of homelessness and campaigns to affect policy in the UK, making the necessary changes to solve homelessness. They have local centres across the UK, with one in Edinburgh. Crisis Skylight Edinburgh support their members out of homelessness and help with routes into education and work, through advice and guidance sessions and practical and creative workshops. These can take place in hostels, day centres or libraries across the city and they work in collaboration with other local projects such as The Rock Trust and Bethany Christian Trust. In consultation with their members they run an evolving timetable of activities many of which involve the arts.

Over the course of the year they run guitar and keyboard lessons, a choir, a music jam and a creative writing group. They also run a cinema club in the local public cinema. Arts activities may be weekly or may run as a one-off event. An annual project that is something of a treat in Edinburgh is The Art in Crisis programme, presenting art created by artists experiencing homelessness. Members have an opportunity to work with professional local artists and publicly exhibit. In 2017 tour guides were trained from Crisis to give public tours of the Museum of Scotland. They also ran a photography exhibition with pictures seen across the city on billboards. They continue to train members to become tour guides in partnership with the Museum of Scotland.

Crisis focuses on working with people who are currently experiencing homelessness or have been homeless in the last two years. The emphasis is on progression and giving the necessary support to help people move on to the next step. This is a different focus to some of the other homeless day centres.
and projects featured in this report. It demonstrates the need for suitable arts-based community projects for members when they leave Crisis.

**The Bethany Christian Trust**

Bethany Christian Trust are a charity committed to relieving the immediate suffering and meeting the long-term needs of homeless and vulnerable people in Scotland. They run an emergency and resettlement programme which includes residential units and a care shelter and a street care van in Edinburgh. They also provide short stay breaks for isolated families and a befriending service. Their Support Workers offer service users help with a range of issues to enable people to live more independently. These include; budgeting, finding work, benefits, addiction support, and help with developing social skills.

Their community development work in Edinburgh offers people who have experienced homelessness a range of high quality inclusive arts activities.

The Bugle group produces four magazines a year. It is over ten years old and through creative writing and art its seeks to enable people to find their own voice. It is circulated in libraries around Leith.

Bethany also work with Edinburgh’s Streetreads, on organisation that give books to readers who have experienced homelessness and The Scottish Book Trust, a charity inspiring people to read and write.

There is currently a men’s choir and they have previously had a guitar group run by Inspire as well as a drama group.

A focus for these groups is allowing participants to come ‘out of the dark’ and find their voice within a safe space. Colin Campbell, a Community Development Worker from Bethany described the benefits that then come from the ‘performance’ element of all these arts activities. He believes it allows people with lived experience of homelessness to connect and speak to a wider audience and ultimately change society.

‘If these voices are not being heard then this democracy and our communities are deficient. They won’t be working for everybody they’ll be working for a few people that can articulate themselves in the way that fit in with the norms of society. So, it’s so important to have spaces for these people to have their voice heard and art is such a powerful way of doing that’

Colin Campbell, Community Development Worker, The Bethany Christian Trust.

If these voices are not being heard then this democracy and our communities are deficient. They won’t be working for everybody they’ll be working for a few people that can articulate themselves in the way that fit in with the norms of society. So, it’s so important to have spaces for these people to have their voice heard and art is such a powerful way of doing that’

Colin Campbell, Community Development Worker, The Bethany Christian Trust.
Bethany Christian Trust’s Lost and Found Choir

Salvation Army and the Niddry Street Drop-in Centre

The Salvation Army is an international church and charitable organisation working in 128 different countries, who aim to transform people’s lives through the love of God and by supporting the most vulnerable in society. In the UK and republic of Ireland they offer over 80 homeless services which include hostels, known as Life Houses, day centres and support on the street. They have a strong musical tradition and recognised in the UK through performances of their local brass bands and other music outputs. These help generate funding and awareness of the charity. 

The research team met with Michael McGraw the Programme Coordinator based at the Niddry Street drop-in day centre and learnt about the arts-based activities that the Salvation Army run. They formed a choir for Christmas in the west of Scotland made up of service users from various day centres and Life Houses. They also ran an art and music group run at the Pleasance Life House in Edinburgh. Niddry Street drop-in day centre offers food, shower facilities, one to one support and a chaplaincy service. They support people experiencing homelessness who struggle to engage with other services to set goals to move forward with their lives. In the afternoon there is currently an ‘arty class’ run by volunteers, a creative writing and art group called ‘Heads and Tails’ run by Crisis and there are plans to set up a movie afternoon.

The arts activities are focused on building confidence within a safe supportive space and developing life skills. The groups are small and unlike other day centres the continuation of a group is not dependent on numbers – if only one person turns up to an activity, the Salvation Army still see this as a success.

The road, Niddry Street is also home to St. Cecelia’s Hall, an Edinburgh University venue that is Scotland’s oldest purpose-built concert-hall and houses the most important historic musical instrument collection anywhere in the world. St. Cecelia’s Hall is exploring ways to engage with people at the drop-in centre and for people experiencing homelessness to be involved in the venue. The local police are also involved in this partnership and through this connection attended the first gathering of the Arts and Homelessness Scottish Network in September 2017. This event is discussed further in Section 7.
Raised Voices

Raised Voices is an Edinburgh based charity that brings a fresh and unique approach to working creatively with people who have experienced homelessness. Previously it has drawn on drama, creative writing, play writing and performance, working with a small team based in the community. It has also offered individual creative support such as helping a member secure recording studio time and helping another get a book published. Currently their focus is on drama and staging a play at the Edinburgh Fringe as well as a new initiative training members to review community arts and theatre events. They are also hoping to host an award night at the close of the festival.

‘Being creative is the only time you can be free’
Blair Christie, Director, Raised Voices

This is a unique Scottish set up, run voluntarily by Director, Blair Christie and Board member Archie Gray. It is still growing after four years, which is a testimony to the original idea, the team that lead the work and the groups willingness to adapt and evolve. A community-based group such as this seems vital in offering that stepping stone into community arts, for those looking to move on from arts activities offered within the homeless service. It also directly addresses issues around social isolation for formally homelessness artists not able or willing to access mainstream arts activities. It is hoped that this small but high impact group will be more widely known and better endorsed by other homeless services in Edinburgh.
**Tinderbox**

Tinderbox is a Scottish charity based in Edinburgh that runs a programme of music and creative workshops for young people. It has a focus on bringing together a diverse mix of ideas, experiences and voices and prides itself on offering spaces to inspire and ignite sparks of creativity. They run over one hundred workshops a year with young people of all ages and levels of ability and bring people of different backgrounds together though exciting and contemporary orchestras, events and other productions. They have worked over the last five years with young people experiencing homelessness from the Rock Trust running workshops that respond to their musical interests. These sessions have included song-writing, rap writing, learning pop songs on the guitar and singing tuition. Alongside this strand of Tinderbox are two musical hubs which work with complete beginners to experienced young musicians. They create opportunities for instrumental tuition, joining a band, song-writing, sound engineering, rapping and get involved in arts and crafts.

Tinderbox are an exemplar model of inclusion and demonstrate a lack of hierarchies, which is modelled across the organisation. Young people who have worked with Tinderbox from the Rock Trust are invited to attend the Hubs, meeting a range of other young people from different backgrounds and diverse musical tastes and abilities. The organisation runs an apprenticeship and professional development programme giving its young people experience and training in many aspects of the professional world of music, including community music. Many of the staff were former Tinderbox participants.

There are clearly many other projects and organisations from the table on page 20, that the research team were unable to visit. This was in some instances because contact could not be made with the organisation, or because the researchers only became aware of the work at the end of this review.

It is anticipated and certainly hoped that there will be other arts activities that are running which may come to light once the review is circulated and published. Please do get in touch with With One Voice if you know of any other arts and homelessness projects that have not been featured, at matt@with-one-voice.com
5 - Other Key Stakeholders

As well as visiting and interviewing organisations delivering activities within the arts and homeless sector, the team spoke to other key stakeholders who were keen to have a voice in this review.

1. People experiencing homelessness
2. Homeless Services
3. Edinburgh University
4. Scottish Chamber Orchestra
5. Scottish Government’s Cultural Strategy
6. Creative Scotland
7. With One Voice
8. The Homeless World Cup

1. People Experiencing Homelessness

The team interviewed fifteen people experiencing homelessness. The women at the Chara centre spoke to the research team during a C-Word session, the co-researchers interviewed each other and Darren Murray a formally homeless actor and writer gave an interview. Further input came from the on-line survey and people who attended the first gathering of the arts and homeless sector. The views and opinions as well as some of the quotes are scattered throughout this report but are strongly heard in Section 3, Homelessness in Scotland and in Section 8, Findings.

The over-arching opinion of all we interviewed is that the arts has had and continues to have a powerful and positive impact. It was valued for being a welcome and pleasant distraction, a way to connect and socialise with others and a route into wider opportunities in the community. It was viewed by others as being nothing short of a life-line. More detail about the impact of engaging is explored in Section 4, Why the arts?

All those we interviewed felt more arts opportunities should be available across Scotland.

2. Homeless Services

As well as speaking to the charities already mentioned; Crisis, Bethany Christian Trust, Grassmarket Community Project, Glasgow City Mission and the Lodging House Mission the team also spoke to other homeless services.

David Kidd at the Scottish Homeless Involvement and Empowerment Network (SHIEN) gave an interesting and well-informed overview of the current picture

‘The choir gives her a voice, life is more colourful, not so black or grey’

Angela Vance, Support Worker, Lodging House Mission
of homelessness from the perspective of Glasgow Homeless Network. One message that came from his interview was the need for more community-based arts activities that people who are involved in his service can access. He also said there was a need for case workers to be better informed about arts services so that they can signpost and promote.

Charity Pritchard a support worker based at Cunningham House hostel in Edinburgh revealed with great insight the challenges of running arts activities in a busy city centre hostel. She shared the reality of arts being dependant on hostel staff, perhaps some with an arts background, but with many varied responsibilities which make it difficult to invest time and resources into a group with no guarantee of attendees. She revealed further issues around setting up groups that have fluctuating numbers and a turn-over of residents from one arts project to the next. Crisis and Inspire had both however, run successful short-term projects in the hostel. Charity was passionate about the benefits of the arts and made a strong case for a community worker based in each hostel to initiate and support greater community involvement in the arts.

The overarching message from those working within homeless services is the need for high quality, well run, inclusive arts opportunities for people experiencing homelessness. There was a frustration for some, feeling they constantly had to justify the place and value of the arts. The majority, when asked if Scotland needed more arts activities said a most definite yes. Two people, however, based in organisations offering a range of homeless services said they felt the issues were not related to quantity of sessions but to a greater awareness of the groups already running and they wanted to see more consistency in the number of attending these groups.

All those working within the homeless services contributed to Section 3 Homelessness in Scotland and Section 8, Findings.

3. University of Edinburgh

The Reid School of Music at the University of Edinburgh and in particularly the Institute for Music in Human and Social Development (IMHSD) has consistently shown great commitment and interest in being involved in an arts and homeless movement in Scotland. This in part, is due to the Director of With One Voice, Matt Peacock’s relationship with the Music Department as an alumnus. Matt has regularly been invited to speak to staff and students for over a decade, beginning with the MSc in Music in the Community in 2007, led by Dr Katie Overy and then with the undergraduate programme in Music in the Community, led by Dee Isaacs. Matt also began a new Alumni Micro-Residency with the IMHSD in January 2018.

The department has a strong, long-standing Music in the Community course, headed by Dee Isaacs who was interviewed for the review. Although her students have not yet worked on a university project with people who have experienced homelessness, Dee
has a successful track record of working within the criminal justice setting and with people who are refugees and asylum seekers, both in Scotland and internationally. Dee is keen to develop her work with the homeless sector and has considered ways that her students might run a weekly session over a few months as part of their undergraduate course. This could potentially be an ideal opportunity to galvanise a ‘free’ resource for the sector, giving students a rich opportunity to work in the field and giving people who have experienced homelessness a positive music making experience.

A clear message from the review is that well trained practitioners are needed in Scotland and may help the sector to grow. A training programme for developing the skills of community musicians in the sector could emerge from links with the music department.

Research

Shelly Coyne is based in IMHSD and currently conducting research exploring the world of community choirs and singing groups for people who have experienced homelessness. She has studied groups in Rio and the UK, including choirs in Scotland. She has interviewed a choir leader and singers from Mission Voices, which she set up in 2010, and singers from the Inspire Choir and Grassmarket Community Project Choir. Her thesis will be publicly available in 2019.

The IMHSD is directed by Dr. Katie Overy, who is keen to support the exploration of ways to conduct future research identifying the potential impact of participation in the arts for people who have experienced homelessness.

4. Scottish Chamber Orchestra (SCO)

‘Connect’ is the Creative Learning strand of the SCO and seeks to open new doors of creativity, inspire and support people; giving them a voice, improving confidence and self-esteem through musical engagement. They currently deliver a high-quality musical group experience called Reconnect for people living with dementia and the impact is assessed through a research project conducted by the IMHSD at Edinburgh University. The research team met with Chief executive, Gavin Reid and the Connect Director - Kirsteen Davidson-Kelly.

Although they do not currently work with people who have experienced homelessness, there is a strong appetite to learn about the needs and gaps in the current arts and homeless sector in Scotland and explore engaging in this field. This interest is in part sparked by the current and visible homeless problems in Edinburgh and the building of a new £20 million funded venue in the city. The requirements of building this new concert hall are that that it serves the local community as well as the resident orchestra. The SCO management is keen to involve people with experience of
homelessness in the consultation process for the new building. There are also conversations about running SCO workshops in hostels across Edinburgh.

5. Scottish Government’s Cultural Strategy

The Scottish Government are currently creating a culture strategy for Scotland based on the principles of access, equity and excellence. This strategy is being created in collaboration with artists, cultural organisations and communities across the country. The strategy will position culture as having intrinsic value and contributing both directly and indirectly to the health, wealth and success of the country. Defining Scotland as a diverse and distinct society with creativity and innovation at its heart. It will create an overarching framework to support the long-term development of culture in Scotland. Leonie Bell who is head of National Culture Strategy met with the research team to hear about the arts and homeless sector in Scotland, the diverse activities currently being run and the vision in Scotland for the arts to be at the heart of homeless support services. Leonie acknowledged that the arts can help support an attitudinal shift towards the public’s understanding of homelessness and that there was a drive to make cultural public spaces more accessible for all of the community, including those experiencing homelessness. Leonie felt the arts and homeless sector was little understood in Scotland and more evidence of the impact would help it grow.

6. Creative Scotland

Creative Scotland is the public body that supports the arts, screen and creative industries across all parts of Scotland on behalf of everyone who lives, works or visits the country. They enable people and organisations to work in and experience the arts in Scotland by helping others to develop great ideas and bring them to life. They are a funding, development and advocacy body, and distribute funding from the Scottish Government and The National Lottery. Janet Archer, CEO of Creative Scotland, met with a team from With One Voice prior to this review and subsequently Creative Scotland have supported the review by circulating the on-line survey and hosting the first gathering of the arts and homeless sector in September 2017. The event was an opportunity for organisations to hear about the review, discuss best practice and why the arts are important for people experiencing homelessness, as well as look at funding, network development and defining success. Creative Scotland are supporting the launch event for this Review in September 2018 and galvanising individuals and organisations from the arts and policy sectors to attend and engage with arts and homelessness work in Scotland.

7. With One Voice (WOV)

The Scottish arts and homelessness sector sits within a global community of practice. One of WOV’s main aims is to encourage exchange of practice and policy and it is hoped that work in Scotland will inspire other countries and in turn will be inspired by other international work.
WOV is involved in delivering vital work which will benefit and help inform the Scottish sector;

- An International Literature Review, which will bring together evaluation and impact reports from around the world. This is particularly relevant to Scotland where impact measurement has been raised by policy makers.
- A Review of Cultural Spaces’ Responses to Homelessness, a study sharing practice of how arts venues such as theatres, libraries, galleries and museums are working with homeless people. This report and the Literature Review will be launched at WOV’s International Arts and Homelessness Summit & Festival in Manchester in November 2018. A sharable resource and training package for cultural spaces following in spring 2019.
- A ‘Jigsaw of Homeless Support’ – a theoretical model of how arts and creativity should be a piece of a jigsaw of support and how someone facing homelessness should have access to all pieces of the jigsaw from food to shelter, sports and arts. The Jigsaw will be launched in 2018 and will become part of Greater Manchester’s 10-year homelessness strategy.
- A Paris 2015-20 Mayoral Social Inclusion policy where cultural venues are linked to homeless centres in each district. WOV is looking to spread the practice in the UK and beyond.

8. The Homeless World Cup and Big Issue Scotland and the International Network of Street Papers

Something of a visionary in Scotland, the research team met with Mel Young at the Homeless World Cup headquarters in Edinburgh. Mel started the Big Issue in Scotland in 1993, then was involved in setting up the International Network of Street Papers which then lead onto co-founding the Homeless World Cup with Harald Schmied in 2001.

‘That ball can change the world. It’s not about football really, it’s using football as a way of creating change.’

Mel Young, President, Homeless World Cup

The Homeless World Cup is surely one of the world’s most ambitious and pioneering homeless projects worldwide, seeking to alleviate homelessness through football. This international organisation now operates in 74 countries with its focus is to make positive changes in the lives of their players, by building people up and offering a pathway out of homelessness. Through its annual tournament it also raises awareness and actively uses the media coverage it receives, to change attitudes towards

---

homelessness. While the annual tournament, which Glasgow hosted in 2016, is the pinnacle of their work, their focus is firmly on the impact on the lives of the players through working with their partner organisations in each country. Mel said of the annual tournament, ‘if it was a great event and we weren’t having an impact we wouldn’t do it’.

‘Are you ready for this! The social capital value of the Homeless World Cup in 2016 in Glasgow was $364,000,000!’

Mel Young, President, Homeless World Cup

There is much, it seems that the arts and homeless sector in Scotland can borrow from the Homeless World Cup, not least their commitment to high quality research. A piece of independent research was conducted in 2017, measuring the social capital value of the homeless world cup tournament in 2016 in Glasgow. The report firmly places the value that year at a staggering $364,000,000.

---

6 - The Scottish Arts and Homelessness Survey

An on-line multiple-choice survey, gathering information about the arts and homeless sector in Scotland was made available in July 2017 and ran for four months. The link was sent directly to Scottish arts and homeless projects and promoted in the local press, on Twitter and through Streetwise Opera’s mailing list.

Thirty-two people completed the survey and described themselves in the following categories:

There were three responses from people with lived experience of homelessness

- Two of the respondents had been involved in arts activities including drama, singing and playing and instrument and creative writing.
- One person had not been involved in any arts activities. They said they would most like to try drama, visual art, singing, playing and instrument, film making and crafts.
The three respondents said the biggest barriers to getting involved for people who experience homelessness are
i) No local opportunities to take part
ii) Perceived or actual cost of taking part
iii) Shyness or embarrassment
iv) Too busy or preoccupied
v) Don’t know

Of the other 29 respondents

- 12 had never been involved in any arts and homeless work or activities
- 25 said that the kind of support that would enable them to do more of this work was
  i) More money to run activities (80%)
  ii) Training (56%)
  iii) Working with experienced arts and homeless practitioners (56%)
- When asked what prevents people with lived experience of homelessness from accessing arts activities and services in Scotland, the top three answers were
  i) No previous experience of taking part (62%)
  ii) No local opportunities (59%)
  iii) Shyness or embarrassment (52%)

When all the respondents were asked if they think Scotland needs more arts activities for homeless people

- 84.4% said yes
- 12.5 % said don’t know
- 3.1% said No
7 - First Gathering of the Arts and Homeless Scottish Network

In September 2017, the first gathering of an arts and homeless sector in Scotland met in Edinburgh. It was a joint event with With One Voice, Creative Scotland and the IMHSD at Edinburgh University and had 54 attendees. All those who had been approached about the review were invited and it was promoted through Edinburgh University and Creative Scotland networks as well as being advertised publicly.

- The gathering was welcomed by Gary Cameron from Creative Scotland.
- Co-researchers Pat McLean and Ann McKenna gave a presentation about conducting the review.
- Darren Murray, an artist with lived experience of homelessness spoke on behalf of co-researcher, William Leadbetter.
- Matt Peacock gave an overview about With One Voice.
- Shelly Coyne gave an overview of the review so far and posed three provocations to the floor for feedback and discussion. There were
  i) Funding - our greatest friend, our biggest challenge!
  ii) What does success look like and how is it measured?
  iii) How should we connect and celebrate?
- Five arts and homeless projects gave Pecha Kucha presentations.
- Phylida Shaw, a researcher with With One Voice introduced the cultural spaces action research being conducted internationally.

8 – Findings

This review has gathered evidence, opinions and personal testimonies from four data collection phases, i) a mapping phase, plotting all the key organisations involved in delivering the work and those interested in the sector, ii) visiting and interview period, iii) an on-line survey and iv) notes taken from the first gathering of the arts and homelessness sector in Scotland event.

- 44 people were interviewed for the review, 11 arts and homeless projects were visited, 32 people completed the on-line survey and 54 people attended the gathering event.

- 23 organisations and projects were identified that were currently or had previously delivered arts work with people experiencing homelessness in Scotland.

There were four key themes that emerged from the review and informed the recommendations;
1. What does best practice look like?

Who should deliver the arts activity? It seems that the most effective work is being delivered by experienced, committed, flexible, highly empathetic, consistent practitioners who have built strong relationships with participants. Listening and responding to the needs of participants was considered essential and making them feel safe. They should be committed to the arts, able to offer a high-quality experience but have a fundamental understanding of the needs of the group. Sessions that were most effective were run by staff who seemed to feel valued and well supported themselves and where there was a high staff ratio or where sessions had additional support staff. The importance of the relationships between practitioners and participants cannot be underestimated and is crucial to the success of an activity and subsequent benefits for participants. Maintaining the same members of staff either for the duration of a short-term project or long term for a weekly session is the preferred model.

Training – The second largest barrier to more arts and homeless work being delivered was a lack of training and finding suitable practitioners. The only known training model was through Givin’ it Laldie, training choir leaders alongside the Mission Voices choir at the Lodging House Mission. It is assumed though that there is unofficial training and mentoring happening within organisations, but no known official training programme is currently available in Scotland. Through the review there have been conversations about setting up a training programme in partnership with Jane Davidson at Scottish Opera, Shelly Coyne who ran the training programme at Givin’ it Laldie and a team of people with lived experience of homelessness.

Arts Activities – The most successful activities seem to be conducted in an environment that is safe, warm and inviting, with humour and laughter. Those that were well planned and of high artistic quality were favoured and participants responded positively to consistency and working towards a goal. People with lived experience who attended the sessions wanted activities to be delivered in partnership with them, a ‘with not for’ approach.

Progression - One thing that is clear from this review is that there needs to be an onwards path of progression built into the arts and homeless sector with groups set up to meet participants at the many various points through and beyond homelessness. If the goal is about supporting people to move on with their lives, then the sector needs to respond accordingly. Community based arts opportunities outside of homeless services, like the Citizen’s Theatre’s Community Collective, Inspire’s Community Choir or Raised Voices are essential. These groups, which participants can attend once they have secure accommodation may play some part in addressing social isolation and helping participants to maintain a tenancy. This supports the recommendations from the Housing First pilot evaluation report (p.15).
Signposting - A recurring frustration from the day centres and hostels was poor attendance at existing arts programmes. This may be due to several reasons; issues with the practitioner delivering the work, the session not responding to the needs or interests of the intended participants, the venue or the time of day. Another key barrier is the arts activities are not always widely promoted and there may be a fear on the part of the potential participant to initially attend. This is where signposting is essential. Within homeless services these activities could be advertised, with case workers and support workers promoting them. Success stories were shared about support workers who attended arts sessions with new participants for the first few weeks.

Participants – A further question that emerged from the review was the issue of what stage in the person’s trajectory through homelessness might a person wish to and be able to engage with different forms of arts activity. The 3-year partnership with Scottish Opera and the Lodging House Mission choir for example may, in part, have been a success because of the stability of the singers who were in the choir, the majority of who had stable accommodation.

2. How do we know it’s working?

While everyone we spoke to was passionate about the benefits of arts activities for people who experience homelessness, there is no consensus on what organisations are measuring to record the impact. Many day centres are looking at the numbers attending an activity and for as long as they meet an attendance target, the session will continue. The benefits that are observed by staff are anecdotal and not recorded unless a case study is required for a funding application. Only a few organisations are measuring specific outcomes. Grassmarket Community Project asks tutors to complete a form at every session which records a variety of different outcomes. These range from recording the numbers of people who learnt something that day, introduced themselves to someone new or helped to set up the room without being instructed. Higher impact outcomes are also included, such as recording the numbers of people who are more employable or more able to volunteer as a result of attending the session. External evaluations bring further evidence to support the aims of an organisations and Inspire conducted one in February 2017. Despite the evaluation showing they were meeting their principle outcome of offering participatory music opportunities for people often denied access and they demonstrated personal benefits for musicians and wider community engagement, they were unable to secure funding to continue that year.

Success looks different for different projects, and each will have a unique focus on what the arts activity is hoping to achieve. One day-centre seemed to focus on getting people away from sitting with a cup of tea watching the TV all day, while another wanted to help give participants the skills to move on with their lives in some way. From the first gathering of the arts and homeless sector in September 2017 there was an appetite to work more closely as a sector to share outcomes and measuring tools.
The social capital research conducted for the Homeless World Cup could be a fascinating model for the Scotland arts and homeless sector to consider in the future.

3. The biggest challenge of all – funding!

Funding, it seems is the largest issue facing the sector in Scotland and the most popular answer from the on-line survey when respondents were asked what would enable them to deliver more arts activities. Organisations across the board want long term funding, that is not related to meeting unrealistic targets and outcomes and allows them to plan and develop beyond the short term. This brings consistency for participants, enables staff retention and helps sustain strong staff/participant relationships, allowing for progression and forward planning.

- Organisations fund their work in a variety of ways - The Citizens Theatre and the Chara Centre – work on a three-year funding cycle that seems to bring some stability and allow for medium term planning. This is the exemplar model.
- Many of the day centres are supported by Christian charities and their core services including art activities are funded through the local churches.
- Some high-quality work is being delivered on a voluntary basis.
- We heard of three organisations that had tried to start an arts activity but were prevented due to unsuccessful funding applications.

Some informative issues around funding emerged;

- Concerns with the time it takes to apply for funding - one interviewee said a Creative Scotland application took approximately twenty days of her part time job and the application proved to be unsuccessful.
- If funding is related to participant number outcomes, then how can we justify sessions that very few participants initially attend
- The language often used in funding applications is loaded with the stigma we are trying to address, which feels inconsistent with the aims of the work.
- Partnership working may be effective but what if there are different working practises; such as different pay scales for practitioners versus core staff, or when aims of each organisation do not make an exact fit.
- Many of those interviewed wanted the arts to be considered as a valuable and core part of homeless services. With One Voice’s, Jigsaw of Homeless Support21 is a useful model to consider. This might help support the argument for Scotland to be the first country in the world to adopt an embedded arts and homeless policy, which was the original vision that initiated this review.

---

4. How do we connect and find our voice?

There is a strong appetite in Scotland to create a network of those interested in arts and homelessness in Scotland; people with lived experience of homelessness, people working in homeless centres and services, arts organisations, practitioners, policy makers, funders, people linked to cultural spaces, academics and others interested in the sector. This might offer a platform for support, awareness raising, recognition, a place to find practitioners, to hear about training and to showcase best practice.

This would help Scotland to create a movement; to grow the sector, help support each other, give a public voice to the work and create an opportunity for political influence. Scottish Prison Arts Network is a model that Scotland could perhaps look to emulate, which meets informally three to four times a year, hosted by different organisations. A similar arts and homeless forum has been set up in the South East of England. With One Voice has set up local networks in a number of countries and the same zero-cost model could be adopted in Scotland.

Some interviewees suggested putting on an event in the future to celebrate the work in Scotland, such as a Homeless Festival. This could be a celebration of all the arts and homeless practises alongside a shared platform for homeless support services. While this might be something for the future, those involved in running choirs in the sector have already discussed coming together for a shared day of singing.

Scotland clearly has a rich and diverse arts and homeless sector with a wealth of innovative projects, which have been found predominantly in Glasgow and Edinburgh. Those delivering and participating in activities without exception were passionate about the work and keen to share experiences about the positive impact. All but two interviewees said Scotland needed more arts for people experiencing homelessness. The sector is disjointed and disparate, and there is a strong sense that people want to be connected and feel part of a network. There was also a feeling that work is undervalued. This was within homeless organisations where other services are viewed as more important, by those who have been unable to financially support the continuation or start-up of new projects and by participants.
9 - Recommendations

1. **Link those who are interested across the sector to form a network.**
   - It has been suggested that creating a self-supporting community like the Scottish Prison Arts Network would benefit the sector.
   - An open network could enable the sharing of resources, best practise, funding streams as well as training and mentoring opportunities. The network could also be a hub to share practice and policy beyond Scotland, with the international arts and homelessness sector.
   - A network would help raise awareness of current activities and help with promotion and signposting.
   - A network could help make links between organisations offering or seeking resources.

2. **Increase awareness of other organisations delivering arts activities or wishing to deliver activities in Scotland**
   - To explore other activities that are happening across Scotland particularly out-with Glasgow and Edinburgh.
   - To discover other organisations that wish to deliver this work but have so far been unable.

3. **Look at creating and implementing a training model to bolster the sector with appropriately trained arts practitioners.**

4. **Support the sector to gather evidence to improve the delivery and validate the impact of the work**
   - Sharing of impact measures across the sector.
   - Collecting a bank of evaluation reports, academic research and case studies, using With One Voice’s Literature Review as a starting point.
   - Conducting academic research across Scotland.

5. **Help organisations explore how they might secure long-term embedded or partnership funding.**
   - Run a funding awareness day with funders and successful projects who have secured long term funding.
   - Work with policy makers, funders and academics to consider long term embedded funding.
   - Share best practise from other successful projects such as Streetwise Opera.

6. **For the sector to unite and work towards a national arts event, showcasing and celebrating work in Scotland.**
10 - Conclusions

This review is by no means an exhaustive list of all the organisations and people interested and committed to arts and homelessness in Scotland, it is however a snapshot from a broad spectrum of voices. It seeks to give a flavour of the rich and varied work and the passion with which it is both delivered and received. It also explores some of the challenges with sustaining the work.

Scotland clearly has a rich and diverse arts and homeless sector with a wealth of innovative projects, which have been found predominantly in Glasgow and Edinburgh. Those delivering and participating in activities without exception were passionate about the impact with over 95% of those interviewed and 84.4% of those completing the on-line survey saying Scotland needs more arts for people experiencing homelessness. There was also a sense though, that the work is undervalued. Funding was the biggest barrier to more activities being delivered followed by lack of suitably trained practitioners. The sector is disjointed and disparate, but there is a strong sense that people want to be connected and feel part of a network.

While the recommendations suggest the steps that Scotland might take to grow and develop the arts and homeless sector in Scotland, it is perhaps useful to consider a strategic focus.

This could take the form of first sustaining the current work, followed by growing and developing the sector, while exploring how the arts may become embedded in Scottish policy within homeless services.

1. Sustain the current field by supporting organisations currently or recently delivering arts activities.
2. Find other organisations and projects delivering arts activities that have not featured in the report and invite them into a network.
3. Find organisations and projects that want to develop arts activities and support them to grow the sector.
4. Look at ways to measure the impact of the work in Scotland.
5. Encourage policy makers to draw on the evidence to explore embedding arts practise within the homeless services nationwide.

www.with-one-voice.com

@With1V
with1voice
@With1V
11 - With Thanks

This review would not have been possible without the support commitment and enthusiasm of so many people.

Thanks to With One Voice who from a distance saw something special and worthy of exploring and researching in Scotland. Big thanks to Matt Peacock and Ellie Raymont.

Thanks to the Scottish Graduate School of Arts and Humanities who funded Shelly Coyne to join their internship programme and break from her PhD for 3 months to do a placement with With One Voice and conduct this review.

Thanks to IMHSD at Edinburgh University and Creative Scotland for supporting this review from the start.

Thanks to the willingness of so any arts projects, homeless organisations, policy makers, funders, academics and others interested in this work, for giving up their time so generously to meet the research team and share their valuable experience. We hope we have captured your tireless enthusiasm for supporting homelessness in Scotland.

Thanks to the people with lived experience of homelessness whose passion for the arts has always remained at the heart of this review and been our primary motivation. With special thanks to Darren Murray.

Finally, a huge thanks to co-researchers, William Leadbetter, Jacqui Rogers, Ann McKenna and Pat McClean, who gave of themselves so generously both in sharing their experiences and giving so much of their time. You helped not only in shaping this review, making it stronger and more robust, but also setting an agenda for co-production to be a feature of all With One Voice work.

Photos from the front cover

Top Left – The Women’s Own group singing at the Chara Centre
Top Right - Actors from Raised Voices performing in Home
Bottom Left - Performance of the opera, Blue Tango Club with singers from the Lodging House Mission Choir and Scottish Opera (Photo credit: Robin Mitchell)
Bottom Right - William Leadbetter a member of the Community Collective performing in On Common Ground with the Citizens Theatre.

All the photographs throughout the report have been taken by the lead researcher or shared from the lead organisations with professional credits given where due.
Where people with lived experience of homelessness are identifiable, permission has been granted by the individual or through the parent organisation.